GREEN skills for enterprises - Sustainable Training for Automotive suppliers clusteR

Leonardo da Vinci TOI n. 2013-1-IT1-LEOO5-03983

Project Evaluation: (Final) Implementation Update

Alberto Vergani

21-22/09/2015

This project has been funded with support from the European Commission. This contents reflects the views only of the author, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

The evaluation focuses

Three focuses for evaluation

(p. 85 of the Application Form)

a) Meetings and workshops participants "perceived effectiveness"

b) Action Plans testing evaluation (on-going during implementation)

c) (GT VET Blueprint model) Transfer impact study (evaluation)

Plus one *focus* emerging from project implementation:

Partnership Added Value Perception

This project has been funded with support from the European Commission. This contents reflects the views only of the author, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

Lifelong Learning Programme

GREEN STAR
GREEN skills for enterprises Sustainable Training for Automotive suppliers clusteR

CONFINDUSTRIA Veneto SIAV S.P.A.
KNOWLEDGE & INNOVATION

Evaluation activities: methods

a) Partners meetings and dissemination workshops participants "perceived effectiveness": *survey* with questionnaire

b) Action Plans testing (on-going) evaluation: *survey* with questionnaire (evaluation form filled by 'AP managers')

c) (GT VET Blueprint model) Transfer impact study (evaluation): *the main evaluation focus* (different methods for VET orgg/intermediate institutions and for companies)

d) Partnership Added Value Perception: *survey* with questionnaire

This project has been funded with support from the European Commission. This contents reflects the views only of the author, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

Lifelong Learning Programme

GREEN STAR
GREEN skills for enterprises Sustainable Training for Automotive suppliers clusteR

CONFINDUSTRIA Veneto SIAV S.P.A.
KNOWLEDGE & INNOVATION

Implemented Evaluation Activities (until 9/2015)

- Project evaluation design presentation and validation (Mestre Meeting, Dec 2013)
- Meetings/seminars evaluation questionnaires preparation (Dec 2013-Mar 2014) ; questionnaires delivery in Mestre (Dec 2013), Dortmund (Jun 2014), Cluj (Nov 2014), Bilbao (May 2015) meetings/events; questionnaires elaborations and analysis
- General definition and design of Regione Veneto case-study concerning GT-VET model adoption in regional apprenticeship system (May 2014-July 2015)
- Contribution to *Project Interim Report* (Oct 2014)
- Partnership perceived *Added Value* questionnaire preparation; survey protocol definition and implementation (Oct 2014-July 2015)
- APs implementation on-going evaluation questionnaire preparation, delivery and analysis (March-May 2015)
- Operational definition of an *Impact Study Protocol* (for APs implemented by companies) and of a training modules recipients *evaluation questionnaire* (for APs implemented by training organisations and Veneto Region) (March-May 2015)
- Training modules evaluation questionnaire delivery and analysis (April-May 2015)
- Impact Study Protocol/Form application to API, Bruss and Sinterom Action Plans (May-July 2015)

This project has been funded with support from the European Commission. This contents reflects the views only of the author, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

Lifelong Learning Programme

GREEN STAR
GREEN skills for enterprises Sustainable Training for Automotive suppliers clusteR

CONFINDUSTRIA Veneto SIAV S.P.A.
KNOWLEDGE & INNOVATION

Final Questionnaire on APs implemented by Training Providers

Focus on *potential (perspective) use* of training contents

-**Energy module** (ITS Mecc., CCI Cluj, Forema: 62 respondents): *new contents* for students but *largely not* for employed (also apprentices), quite interesting, clear presentation, right module duration, usefulness depending on job (relevant for appr.) but quite useful for *finding* a job, important but not necessary for professional future, clear understanding of core-contents

-**LCA module** (ITS Mecc., SIAV, Forema: 51 respondents): new contents for students but also for employed (less for appr.), interesting, right module duration (more time for employed), usefulness depending on job but in general useful/quite important, important but not necessary for professional future (students) or for the actual professional position (employed), "competitive advantage" compared to colleagues who did not attended the *module* (less for appr.)

-**Waste module** (Forema, 15 resp.): mostly *already known* contents, largely coherent with recipients jobs, quite interesting, right module duration, usefulness depending on recipients jobs, quite useful for actual recipients jobs, *in theory* "competitive advantage" compared to colleagues who did not attended the *module* (but companies are not interested ...), important but not necessary for apprentices training

This project has been funded with support from the European Commission. This contents reflects the views only of the author, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

Lifelong Learning Programme

GREEN STAR
GREEN skills for enterprises Sustainable Training for Automotive suppliers clusteR

CONFINDUSTRIA Veneto SIAV S.P.A.
KNOWLEDGE & INNOVATION

Focus on Model Transfer Impact Evaluation

The project logic: model transfer through specific <u>Action Plans</u>

Linking each Action Plan (contents, implementation process, context interactions) with its effects (target-population *green skills* development and workplace activation) using a *Theory Based Impact Evaluation* approach (a non-counterfactual approach)

V

"Contribution" and not "attribution"

V

"To show how the intervention is expected to work and make a difference (TOC, <u>Theory of Change</u>) ... and verify to what extent (TOC) it matches what is observed to have happened"

This project has been funded with support from the European Commission. This contents reflects the views only of the author, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

Lifelong Learning Programme

GREEN STAR
GREEN skills for enterprises Sustainable Training for Automotive suppliers clusteR

CONFINDUSTRIA Veneto SIAV S.P.A.
KNOWLEDGE & INNOVATION

Transfer Impact Evaluation: case-study based on Mayne's 6 steps of Contribution Analysis (CA)

1. Set out the cause-effects issue to be addressed
2. Develop the postulated Theory of Change and risks to it, including alternative explanations
3. Gather existing evidence on the Theory of Change
4. Assemble and assess the "contribution story" and the challenges to it
5. Seek out additional evidence
6. Revise and strengthen the "Contribution story"

Techniques: documents analysis; in-site observation; semi-structured/in-depth interviews

This project has been funded with support from the European Commission. This contents reflects the views only of the author, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

APs implemented by API, BRUSS, SINTEROM: impact study protocol application/1

-

-APs totally coinciding with adaptation and delivery of GT-VET modules for waste and energy while for LCA a new module was set up

- **Long-term outcomes**: quite significant in terms of (mainly potential) profile and strategic relevance although their verification has been partial because the time-span between APs conclusions and evaluation was shorter than needed (see tables below)

- **LT (but also intermediate) outcomes:** they have very different contents and profiles concerning both training direct recipients and companies; each company balance between these two *levels* is linked/related to the existing integration/synergy between the AP and other company-based interventions focusing on the same APs issues

This project has been funded with support from the European Commission. This contents reflects the views only of the author, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

Lifelong Learning Programme

GREEN STAR
GREEN skills for enterprises Sustainable Training for Automotive suppliers clusteR

CONFINDUSTRIA Veneto SIAV S.P.A.
KNOWLEDGE & INNOVATION

APs implemented by API, BRUSS, SINTEROM : impact study protocol application/2

- Company-specific **intervening variables** between AP implementation and its outcomes increase by number and relevance moving from immediate to intermediate to long-term outcomes. The combination of this *element* with the basic-level of training modules contents causes a progressive *reduction* of AP (net) *contribution* from immediate to LT outcomes

- The **assumptions and risks** associated to each AP *Theory-of-Change* are not banal; they make more complex and less linear (as it has to be) the *results chain* which keeps together the AP outputs and AP different levels of outcomes

- Each AP **alternative explanations** give evidence (together with the influencing factors) of the high complexity characterizing the relationship between each AP (implementation and results), its company context and the internal-external intervening actors and stakeholders system

This project has been funded with support from the European Commission. This contents reflects the views only of the author, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

APs implemented by API, BRUSS, SINTEROM : impact study protocol application/3a

	Outputs	Short-immediate outcomes	Medium/ intermediate outcomes	Long-term/ Final outcomes
Company A (LCA)	Meetings and lessons; documents; analysis report; training attendance (company employees and customers' employees); external consultants and technicians participation	Increase of both company and customer employees of knowledge and understanding of LCA method contents and benefits; customer's acquisition of documented evidences concerning its product environmental sustainability	Customer's order acquisition by the company (the customer is the one involved in AP)	New customers and/or orders acquisition and therefore company's turnover's increase
Company B (Energy)	Level 1-2 module trained employees; Level 3-4 trained employees; training hours delivered for each module level; level of satisfaction for training; trainees self-perceived learning achievements	Energy consumption reduction of 312 MWh equivalent to 22.065 Euros saving which is around 9% of 2014 total energy cost; increase of training recipients skills and knowledge in energy saving and energy efficient use; training recipients direct involvement in the implementation of efficient technological and production processes	Consolidation of energy consumption reduction by 9% a year; training recipients active contribution in optimizing gas and electrical consumption; training recipients increase of activation and involvement in generating new ideas for reducing energy waste	Further consolidation of energy consumption reduction by 9% a year; increase of efficiency in production processes and therefore of general company competitiveness; increase of company revenue-generation capacity

This project has been funded with support from the European Commission. This contents reflects the views only of the author, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

APs implemented by API, BRUSS, SINTEROM : impact study protocol application/3b

	Outputs	Short-immediate outcomes	Medium/ intermediate outcomes	Long-term/ Final outcomes
Company C (Waste)	Level 1-2 module trained employees; Level 3-4 trained employees; number of training hours for each module level; level of satisfaction for training; trainees' self-perceived learning achievements	Increase of training recipients knowledge and understanding of waste management complexity and of environmental impact of workplace activities (also at individual level); adoption of environment-friendly working practices (at individual level)	Improvement in waste elements classification (individual and organisation/unit level); involvement of trained employees (4 levels module) in the definition of waste management improvement actions (supporting and integrating *environmental technicians* who until now have been the only responsible for improvement actions)	Improvement of Waste Quality Audit results (after vs before training); reduction/diminution of spill situations in fluid waste areas; diminution of no/incorrectly labeled materials numbers in waste storage areas; increase in waste management proposals number from trained employees to environmental technicians (as a consequence of an improvement of knowledge and awareness about waste management correctness and compliance to existing norms and regulations)

This project has been funded with support from the European Commission. This contents reflects the views only of the author, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

APs implemented by API, BRUSS, SINTEROM : impact study protocol application/4

	Short-immediate outcomes	Medium/ intermediate outcomes	Long-term/ Final outcomes	Notes
Company A (LCA)	Achievement: 5 AP contribution: 100%	Achievement: 5 AP contribution: 50%	Achievement: 2 AP contribution: 30%	AP implementation concluded in May 2015
Company B (Energy)	Achievement: 3 AP contribution: 100%	Achievement: too early for this type of outcome AP contribution: NA	Achievement: too early for this type of outcome AP contribution: NA	Training module level 1-2 delivered by 6/2015; level 3-4 delivering to be concluded by 11/2015
Company C (Waste)	Achievement: 5 AP contribution: 100%	Achievement: too early for this type of outcome AP contribution: NA	Achievement: too early for this type of outcome AP contribution: NA	AP implementation concluded in July 2015

This project has been funded with support from the European Commission. This contents reflects the views only of the author, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.

Lifelong Learning Programme

GREEN STAR
GREEN skills for enterprises Sustainable Training for Automotive suppliers clusteR

CONFINDUSTRIA Veneto SIAV S.P.A.
KNOWLEDGE & INNOVATION

www.greenstar.eu

www.knowledgeandinnovation-siav.net

www.siav.net

email: **area.progetti@siav.net**

Tel: **+39 041/25.17.541**

This project has been funded with support from the European Commission. This contents reflects the views only of the author, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.